PPIC

# Key Factors in Arrest Trends and Differences in California's Counties 

Technical Appendices

## CONTENTS

Appendix A. Additional Tables and Analyses
Appendix B. Information on Contextual Data

Magnus Lofstrom, Brandon Martin, Justin Goss, Joseph Hayes, and Steven Raphael

## Appendix A. Additional Tables and Analyses

FIGURE A1
Statewide trends in arrest rates are largely driven by crime rates


SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Crimes and Clearances Files, and California Department of Finance Population Data, 1980-2016.

NOTES: Arrest rates are the number of arrests made by law enforcement agencies per 100,000 residents, while crime rates are the number of reported crimes per 100,000 residents. The figure shows R-squared values for each model of monthly arrest rates, controlling for current and one-year lagged monthly violent and property crime rates.

TABLE A1
OLS Regressions, County Level Total Arrest Rate.

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Police/Jail Capacity | Demographics /Population Density | Economic Factors | Immigration /Education* | All Factors w/o Crime | All Factors w/ Crime | All* |
| Violent Crime Rate |  |  |  |  |  | 0.45 | 0.99 |
| SE |  |  |  |  |  | 1.47 | 1.94 |
| Property Crime Rate |  |  |  |  |  | 0.27 | 0.51 |
| SE |  |  |  |  |  | 0.37 | 0.39 |
| Officer Rate | -2.51 |  |  |  | 2.93 | 2.63 | 1.11 |
| SE | 2.49 |  |  |  | 3.95 | 4.04 | 4.55 |
| ADP/Rated Capacity | 1,662.85** |  |  |  | 94.68 | 1,085.57 | 2,198.43* |
| SE | 735.74 |  |  |  | 809.21 | 896.14 | 1,224.86 |
| Rated Capacity/Population | 11.41*** |  |  |  | $5.48{ }^{*}$ | 6.49*** | 9.86*** |
| SE | 2.22 |  |  |  | 2.78 | 2.36 | 3.43 |
| Proportion African American |  | -5,214.95 |  |  | 3,752.75 | -9,864.50* | -9,709.87 |
| SE |  | 3,246.33 |  |  | 3,222.31 | 5,062.73 | 6,057.12 |
| Proportion Latino |  | -1,773.04* |  |  | -5,484.57 | -2,258.53* | -3,327.81 |
| SE |  | 1,004.12 |  |  | 7,605.08 | 1,294.55 | 2,630.69 |
| Proportion Other |  | -3,830.87** |  |  | 1,350.23 | -4,881.65 | -9,053.83* |
| SE |  | 1,469.28 |  |  | 2,635.94 | 3,710.00 | 4,976.49 |
| Share 18-29 Year Olds |  | 17,501.86*** |  |  | 9,181.57 | 7,526.88 | 2,228.67 |
| SE |  | 6,334.90 |  |  | 6,872.37 | 6,843.10 | 6,977.19 |
| Proportion Male |  | 26,992.31 |  |  | 1,918.97 | 843.34 | 19,257.49 |
| SE |  | 16,817.29 |  |  | 12,596.34 | 12,260.74 | 16,904.47 |
| Population Density |  | -0.18** |  |  | -0.15* | -0.21* | -0.33** |
| SE |  | 0.07 |  |  | 0.08 | 0.13 | 0.14 |
| Average Annual Earnings |  |  | -0.01 |  | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.00 |
| SE |  |  | 0.01 |  | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.02 |
| Poverty Rate |  |  | 3,408.24 |  | 7,026.93 | 4,164.61 | 2,901.45 |
| SE |  |  | 5,613.95 |  | 4,414.25 | 3,956.76 | 5,318.93 |
| Unemployment Rate |  |  | 13,693.49** |  | 7,154.61* | 5,221.60 | 618.03 |
| SE |  |  | 6,593.83 |  | 3,680.49 | 5,559.87 | 7,946.07 |
| Share Foreign Born* |  |  |  | $-7,422.08^{* * *}$ |  |  | 5,282.51 |
| SE |  |  |  | 1,787.81 |  |  | 5,997.18 |
| Dropout Rate\# |  |  |  | 14,852.61 |  |  | 1,737.06 |
| SE |  |  |  | 12,692.66 |  |  | 5,565.31 |
| College Graduates Rate ${ }^{\text {\# }}$ |  |  |  | -681.85 |  |  | 2,691.47 |
| SE |  |  |  | 2,441.53 |  |  | 3,264.26 |
| 2015 Dummy |  |  |  |  |  |  | -23.66 |
| SE |  |  |  |  |  |  | 162.36 |
| 2016 Dummy |  |  |  |  |  |  | -160.97 |
| SE |  |  |  |  |  |  | 179.12 |
| Constant | -30.11 | -14,759.34* | 2,958.19** | 5,119.11*** | -4,079.66 | -5,775.18 | -20,582.50* |
|  | 1,097.90 | 8,730.08 | 1,111.82 | 1,351.33 | 7,308.79 | 7,155.62 | 11,333.95 |


|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Police/Jail Capacity | Demographics /Population Density | Economic Factors | Immigration /Education* | All Factors w/o Crime | All Factors w/ Crime | All* |
| Observations | 170 | 170 | 170 | 102 | 170 | 170 | 102 |
| R -squared | 0.42 | 0.48 | 0.34 | 0.45 | 0.72 | 0.73 | 0.75 |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Department of Finance Population Data, Board of State and Community Corrections' Jail Profile Survey, California Department of Justice's Law Enforcement Personnel Survey, American Community Survey, California State Controller, California Employment Development Department, and the U.S. Census Bureau's Small Area Income and Poverty Estimates Program, 2014-16.
NOTE: Arrest rates are the number of arrests made by law enforcement agencies per 100,000 residents. \# Data available only for the 41 largest counties. Robust standard errors in rows beneath coefficients, *** $\mathrm{p}<0.01, * * \mathrm{p}<0.05, * \mathrm{p}<0.1$.

TABLE A2
Figure 2 Regression Output

| Crime Rate | Total | Felony |  |  |  |  |  | Misdemeanor |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | All | Violent | Property | Drugs | Warrant | Other | All | Violent | Property | Drugs | Alcohol | Traffic | FTA/ Warrant | Other |
| Violent Current | 2.84*** | 0.49*** | 0.43*** | 0.05 | -0.03 | 0.04* | -0.01 | 2.32*** | 0.16*** | 0.03 | -0.09 | 0.17*** | 1.30*** | 0.30*** | 0.45*** |
| SE | 0.52 | 0.18 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.09 | 0.03 | 0.02 | 0.42 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.08 | 0.07 | 0.25 | 0.05 | 0.09 |
| Property Current | 0.10 | 0.01 | -0.06*** | 0.09*** | 0.02 | -0.03*** | -0.01 | 0.13 | -0.01 | 0.06*** | 0.003 | -0.05** | 0.19*** | -0.02 | -0.07*** |
| SE | 0.13 | 0.04 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.10 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.06 | 0.01 | 0.02 |
| Violent Lagged | $-2.52^{* * *}$ | 0.61*** | 0.19*** | 0.02 | 0.27*** | 0.07*** | 0.05** | -3.19*** | -0.07*** | -0.08*** | -0.07 | -1.06*** | $-2.02^{* * *}$ | $0.25 * * *$ | -0.14* |
| SE | 0.47 | 0.16 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.08 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.38 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.07 | 0.06 | 0.23 | 0.04 | 0.08 |
| Property Lagged | 0.19 | -0.13*** | -0.03*** | -0.01 | -0.07*** | -0.03*** | 0.01** | 0.34*** | -0.01 | 0.04*** | 0.002 | $0.17^{* * *}$ | 0.14** | -0.02 | 0.01 |
| SE | 0.12 | 0.04 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.09 | 0.004 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.06 | 0.01 | 0.02 |
| Observat ions | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 | 408 |
| Rsquared | 0.91 | 0.75 | 0.91 | 0.96 | 0.48 | 0.76 | 0.54 | 0.91 | 0.81 | 0.96 | 0.28 | 0.96 | 0.85 | 0.78 | 0.85 |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Crimes and Clearances Files, and California Department of Finance Population Data, 1980-2016

NOTE: Arrest rates are the number of arrests made by law enforcement agencies per 100,000 residents while crime rates are the number of reported crimes per 100,000 residents. Robust standard errors in rows beneath coefficients, *** $\mathrm{p}<0.01$, ** $\mathrm{p}<0.05$, * $\mathrm{p}<0.1$.

FIGURE A2
Estimated change in annual arrest rates due to AB 109 and Proposition 47


SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Crimes and Clearances Files, and California Department of Finance Population Data, 1980-2016.
NOTES: Estimates based on linear regression models using monthly county level arrest rates by offense group, controlling for current and one-year lagged monthly crime rates, and county fixed effects. The figure shows the estimated impacts of realignment (AB 109) and Prop 47 on annual arrest rates, by arrest offense group (the sum of the two columns would represent the combined effects of the two reforms). Statistical significance is shown with asterisks (*) in parentheses, with the first entry representing realignment and the second Prop 47 . Specifically, *** indicates that the estimate is statistically significant at the 99 percent confidence level, $* *$ is significance at the 95 percent confidence level, and * is significance at the 90 percent confidence level.

## TABLE A3

Figure 3 Regression Output

|  | Total | Felony |  |  |  |  |  | Misdemeanor |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | All | Violent | Property | Drugs | Warrant | Other | All | Violent | Property | Drugs | Alcohol | Traffic | FTA/ Warrant | Other |
| AB 109 | $-66.63^{* * *}$ | -10.34** | $-4.22^{* * *}$ | -4.50*** | -0.20 | $-1.75^{* *}$ | 0.33 | $-51.07^{* * *}$ | -1.51** | -1.18 | $-12.62^{* * *}$ | $-11.25^{* * *}$ | $-12.33^{* * *}$ | -4.04** | -8.15** |
| SE | 13.72 | 3.91 | 1.04 | 1.43 | 1.81 | 0.74 | 1.03 | 11.62 | 0.58 | 0.91 | 1.39 | 2.51 | 4.61 | 1.97 | 3.55 |
| Prop 47 | $-42.37^{* * *}$ | $-37.36^{* * *}$ | $-2.94 * * *$ | $-7.17^{* * *}$ | $-21.48^{* * *}$ | $-3.38^{* * *}$ | $-2.39^{* * *}$ | -3.44 | $-1.08^{* * *}$ | 2.19 *** | $16.11^{* * *}$ | $-6.42^{* * *}$ | -9.12 | 0.07 | -5.19 |
| SE | 14.56 | 2.75 | 0.80 | 0.80 | 1.44 | 0.62 | 0.74 | 12.72 | 0.36 | 0.59 | 2.08 | 1.97 | 5.64 | 2.04 | 4.57 |
| Observations | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 | 23,660 |
| R-squared | 0.78 | 0.78 | 0.81 | 0.86 | 0.62 | 0.65 | 0.65 | 0.76 | 0.73 | 0.79 | 0.56 | 0.68 | 0.65 | 0.59 | 0.57 |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Crimes and Clearances Files, and California Department of Finance Population Data, 1980-2016.
NOTES: Estimates based on linear regression models using monthly county level arrest rates by offense group, controlling for current and one-year lagged monthly crime rates, and county fixed effects. Robust standard errors in rows beneath coefficients, *** p<0.01, ** $p<0.05$, * $p<0.1$.

## FIGURE A3

Proportion of county variance in arrests explained by crime rates


SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Crimes and Clearances Files, and California Department of Finance Population Data, November 2014-December 2016.
NOTES: Arrest rates are the number of arrests made by law enforcement agencies per 100,000 residents, while crime rates are the number of reported crimes per 100,000 residents. The figure shows R-squared for each model of post-Prop 47 county average monthly arrest rates, controlling for post-Prop 47 county average monthly crime rates (homicide, rape, robbery, aggravated assault, burglary, larceny, and motor vehicle theft).

TABLE A4
Figure A3 Regression Output

|  | Total | Felony |  |  |  |  |  | Misdemeanor |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Crime Rate |  | All | Violent | Property | Drugs | Warrant | Other | All | Violent | Property | Drugs | Alcohol | Traffic | FTA/ <br> Warrant | Other |
| Aggravated Assault | 0.71 | 0.64 | 0.39*** | -0.04 | -0.02 | 0.12 | 0.19 | 0.07 | 0.16 | 0.07 | -0.65* | 0.12 | 0.30 | -0.004 | 0.07 |
| SE | 1.39 | 0.42 | 0.12 | 0.10 | 0.13 | 0.13 | 0.16 | 1.18 | 0.14 | 0.09 | 0.37 | 0.28 | 0.46 | 0.30 | 0.35 |
| Robbery | -11.95*** | -2.01** | -0.35 | 0.03 | -0.36 | $-0.78^{* * *}$ | -0.55* | -9.80 ** | $-1.03^{* * *}$ | $-0.37 * *$ | $-1.94 * * *$ | $-1.83 * * *$ | $-2.72^{* * *}$ | $-1.45^{* * *}$ | -0.46 |
| SE | 2.48 | 0.75 | 0.22 | 0.17 | 0.23 | 0.22 | 0.28 | 2.11 | 0.26 | 0.16 | 0.66 | 0.50 | 0.81 | 0.54 | 0.62 |
| Rape | 45.84*** | 2.14 | -0.04 | -0.18 | 0.97 | 0.52 | 0.88 | 43.80*** | 1.99* | 0.67 | 5.53** | 6.51*** | 8.45** | 12.15*** | 8.49*** |
| SE | 10.14 | 3.08 | 0.90 | 0.70 | 0.94 | 0.92 | 1.14 | 8.60 | 1.04 | 0.67 | 2.70 | 2.03 | 3.32 | 2.20 | 2.53 |
| Murder | 114.85* | 28.76 | 14.84** | 3.16 | 9.70 | -5.81 | 6.86 | 83.52 | 7.48 | 2.00 | 25.01 | 8.56 | 29.65 | -10.39 | 21.21 |
| SE | 65.98 | 20.01 | 5.87 | 4.56 | 6.08 | 5.95 | 7.44 | 55.98 | 6.77 | 4.36 | 17.55 | 13.19 | 21.61 | 14.31 | 16.48 |
| Larceny | 0.58** | 0.11 | -0.03 | -0.04** | 0.02 | 0.05** | $0.12{ }^{* * *}$ | $0.47^{* *}$ | 0.06 ** | 0.003 | 0.08 | 0.11** | 0.16 ** | 0.02 | 0.03 |
| SE | 0.24 | 0.07 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.21 | 0.03 | 0.02 | 0.06 | 0.05 | 0.08 | 0.05 | 0.06 |
| Burglary | 3.53 *** | 1.02*** | 0.34*** | 0.27*** | 0.14 | 0.18* | 0.10 | $2.47^{* * *}$ | 0.20* | 0.10 | 0.48* | 0.16 | 0.49 | 0.74*** | 0.30 |
| SE | 1.00 | 0.30 | 0.09 | 0.07 | 0.09 | 0.09 | 0.11 | 0.85 | 0.10 | 0.07 | 0.27 | 0.20 | 0.33 | 0.22 | 0.25 |
| Auto Theft | -0.38 | -0.01 | -0.07 | 0.07 | -0.02 | 0.19* | -0.18 | -0.36 | 0.10 | 0.05 | -0.24 | -0.01 | -0.26 | 0.32 | -0.33 |
| SE | 1.08 | 0.33 | 0.10 | 0.07 | 0.10 | 0.10 | 0.12 | 0.91 | 0.11 | 0.07 | 0.29 | 0.22 | 0.35 | 0.23 | 0.27 |
| Constant | 31.67 | 11.47 | 11.07*** | 7.76*** | -0.32 | -3.49 | -3.55 | 18.79 | -1.98 | 10.64*** | 24.61** | -3.85 | 13.56 | -21.15** | -3.04 |
| SE | 36.86 | 11.18 | 3.28 | 2.55 | 3.40 | 3.33 | 4.16 | 31.27 | 3.78 | 2.436 | 9.801 | 7.37 | 12.07 | 8.00 | 9.20 |
| Observations | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 | 58 |
| R-Squared | 0.72 | 0.64 | 0.75 | 0.55 | 0.28 | 0.52 | 0.45 | 0.68 | 0.57 | 0.35 | 0.44 | 0.46 | 0.49 | 0.63 | 0.36 |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Crimes and Clearances Files, and California Department of Finance Population Data, November 2014-December 2016.
 errors in rows beneath coefficients, *** $p<0.01, * * p<0.05, * p<0.1$.

TABLE A5
Figure 8 Regression Output

|  | Crime Rates | Police/ Jail | Demographic s | Economic Factors | All Factors No Crime | All Factors with Crime | Immigration \& Education | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Violent Crime Rate | -0.028 |  |  |  |  | -1.029* |  | -0.955 |
| SE | 0.894 |  |  |  |  | 0.613 |  | 0.783 |
| Property Crime Rate | $0.932^{* * *}$ |  |  |  |  | $0.428^{* * *}$ |  | 0.257 |
| SE | 0.221 |  |  |  |  | 0.129 |  | 0.202 |
| Officer Rate |  | 38.80*** |  |  | 17.6*** | $15.04{ }^{* * *}$ |  | 16.66*** |
| SE |  | -5.35 |  |  | 3.69 | 4.35 |  | 4.68 |
| ADP/Rated Capacity |  | 1,914.5*** |  |  | 1,089.1*** | 1,217.2*** |  | 843.97 |
| SE |  | -451.43 |  |  | 400.3 | 389.3 |  | 608.1 |
| Rated Capacity/Population |  | $8.47^{* * *}$ |  |  | 3.88 | 4.53* |  | 4.37 |
| SE |  | -2.32 |  |  | 2.80 | 2.612 |  | 3.26 |
| Proportion White |  |  | 9,357.44** |  | 2,661.1 | -689.5 |  | -5,410.4 |
| SE |  |  | -4,295.32 |  | 4,081.2 | 4,537.8 |  | 8,214.1 |
| Proportion African American |  |  | 9,059.50 |  | 22,886.1** | 23,916.8 |  | 16,593.1 |
| SE |  |  | -20,164.70 |  | 9,349.3 | 15,341.6 |  | 21,358.7 |
| Proportion Latino |  |  | -6,552.40 |  | -5,840.1 | -6,512.6 |  | -16,272.7** |
| SE |  |  | -6,308.30 |  | 5,285.9 | 5,751.7 |  | 7,903.4 |
| Share 18-29 Year Olds |  |  | 15,273.8* |  | 4,580.5 | 5,310.2 |  | 13,508.7* |
| SE |  |  | -8,943.90 |  | 10,242.3 | 8,389.1 |  | 6,909.9 |
| Proportion Male |  |  | -39,197.80 |  | -5,875.3 | 10,197.2 |  | -44,371.8 |
| SE |  |  | -32,769.70 |  | 28,002.3 | 32,490.7 |  | 35,735.4 |
| Population Density |  |  | $-2.18^{* * *}$ |  | -1.69*** | $-2.18^{* * *}$ |  | -0.113 |
| SE |  |  | -0.69 |  | 0.44 | 0.44 |  | 0.702 |
| Average Annual Earnings |  |  |  | -0.043*** | 0.008 | 0.005 |  | 0.015** |
| SE |  |  |  | -0.01 | 0.007 | 0.008 |  | 0.007 |
| Poverty Rate |  |  |  | $22,469.5^{* * *}$ | $12,165 \cdot 8^{* * *}$ | $11,580.8^{* * *}$ |  | 590.1 |
| SE |  |  |  | 2,532.9 | 2,522.6 | 2,533.6 |  | 2,837.8 |
| Unemployment Rate |  |  |  | 6,336.1** | 3,760.9** | 3,936.0*** |  | -3638.4 |
| SE |  |  |  | 2,686.9 | 1,442.2 | 1,137.4 |  | 3,817.3 |
| Share Foreign Born* |  |  |  |  |  |  | -9,404.3** | 197.2 |
| SE |  |  |  |  |  |  | 3,792.1 | 2,166.1 |
| Dropout Rate\# |  |  |  |  |  |  | 17,511.8*** | 2,994.6** |
| SE |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2,346.9 | 1,410.6 |
| College Graduates Rate\# |  |  |  |  |  |  | -11,031.8*** | -537.6 |
| SE |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2,541.3 | 2,018.8 |
| Constant | 1,426.9*** | $8,078.6^{* * *}$ | 25,331.4 | 9,332.6*** | 5,733.1 | -159.5 | 9,090.8*** | 25,571.1 |
| SE | -478.7 | -1006.2 | 15,814.3 | 372.9 | 13,235.7 | 17,094.7 | 1,603.7 | 19,592.1 |


|  | Crime Rates | Police/ Jail | Demographic s | Economic Factors | All Factors No Crime | All Factors with Crime | Immigration \& Education | All |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Observations | 965 | 965 | 965 | 965 | 965 | 965 | 408 | 408 |
| R-squared | 0.764 | 0.827 | 0.852 | 0.858 | 0.895 | 0.904 | 0.875 | 0.954 |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Department of Finance Population Data, Board of State and Community Corrections' Jail Profile Survey, California Department of Justice's Law Enforcement Personnel Survey, American Community Survey, California State Controller, California Employment Development Department, and the U.S. Census Bureau's Small Area Income and Poverty Estimates Program, 2014-16.
NOTE: Models use county level annual data for the most recent period, 2014-16. \# indicates that the data available are limited to the 41 largest counties. Robust standard errors in rows beneath coefficients, *** $\mathrm{p}<0.01, * * \mathrm{p}<0.05, * \mathrm{p}<0.1$.

TABLE A6
Mean descriptive statistics of county factors by arrest rate quintiles

|  | Arrest Quintile |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Bottom | $2^{\text {nd }}$ | 3rd | 4th | Top |
| Total Arrest Rate | 2,929 | 3,695 | 4,508 | 5,334 | 6,609 |
| Jail Incarceration Rate | 169.7 | 215.2 | 234.6 | 290.0 | 302.8 |
| Cap Releases/ADP | 1.26 | 3.79 | 2.15 | 4.52 | 7.48 |
| ADP/Capacity | 0.87 | 0.87 | 0.77 | 0.87 | 0.95 |
| Capacity/Pop Rate | 209 | 257 | 320 | 347 | 320 |
| Officer Rate | 155.1 | 138.4 | 169.5 | 148.3 | 201.4 |
| Proportion White | 45.3\% | 56.4\% | 57.4\% | 52.5\% | 66.2\% |
| Proportion African American | 5.2\% | 2.5\% | 2.6\% | 2.7\% | 1.4\% |
| Proportion Latino | 28.9\% | 32.3\% | 30.3\% | 36.6\% | 24.3\% |
| Share Foreign Born* | 28.67 | 22.22 | 21.49 | 21.49 | 13.06 |
| Share 18-29 Year Olds | 15.5\% | 16.7\% | 16.3\% | 17.3\% | 15.9\% |
| Population Density | 2,027 | 232 | 162 | 122 | 46 |
| Unemployment Rate | 5.0\% | 6.5\% | 7.7\% | 9.3\% | 8.4\% |
| Average Annual Earnings | \$67,384 | \$47,435 | \$42,671 | \$41,833 | \$38,920 |
| Poverty Rate | 11.6\% | 13.7\% | 15.8\% | 17.8\% | 19.2\% |
| Dropout Rate ${ }^{\text {\# }}$ | 4.5\% | 5.0\% | 5.3\% | 5.8\% | 5.8\% |
| College Graduates Rate ${ }^{\text {\# }}$ | 42.0\% | 34.3\% | 28.9\% | 23.2\% | 23.4\% |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Department of Finance Population Data, Board of State and Community Corrections' Jail Profile Survey, California Department of Justice's Law Enforcement Personnel Survey, American Community Survey, California State Controller, California Employment Development Department, and the U.S. Census Bureau's Small Area Income and Poverty Estimates Program 2014-16.

NOTES: Arrest rates are the number of arrests made by law enforcement agencies per 100,000 residents, \# Data available only for the 41 largest counties. Each column represents county averages for the respective quintile. Population density is the ratio of residents in a county in a given year to the total square mileage of the county.

TABLE A7
Counties by Average Arrest Rate Quintile

| Counties by Arrest Rate Quintile | 4th | Top |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2nd | 3rd | Alpine | Butte |
| Alameda | Calaveras | Amador | Alen | Del Norte |
| Contra Costa | El Dorado | Glenn | Colusa |  |
| Los Angeles | Lassen | Inyo | Fresno | Humboldt |
| Madera | Mariposa | Merced | Imperial | Kern |
| Marin | Monterey | Napa | Kings | Lake |
| Mono | Nevada | San Bernardino | Modoc | Mendocino |
| Orange | San Benito | Santa Cruz | Plumas | Santa Barbara |
| Placer | San Diego | Sierra | San Luis Obispo | Shasta |
| Riverside | San Joaquin | Solano | Stanislaus | Siskiyou |
| Sacramento | San Mateo | Sonoma | Tulare | Tehama |
| San Francisco | Ventura | Sutter | Tuolumne | Trinity |
| Santa Clara | Yolo |  | Yuba |  |

SOURCES: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Department of Finance Population Data 2014-16.
NOTES: Calculations are quintiles based on each county's average arrest rate over the three year period.

TABLE A8
Mean descriptive statistics of county factors by African American/White arrest rate quintiles

|  | African American/White Arrest Rate Ratio Quintiles |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Bottom | 2nd | 3rd | 4th | Top |
| Arrest Rate Ratio | 1.66 | 2.82 | 3.60 | 4.41 | 6.26 |
| Arrest Rate Gap | 2,599 | 9,002 | 11,597 | 16,374 | 18,457 |
| Overall Arrest Rate | 4,652 | 4,963 | 4,735 | 4,843 | 3,897 |
| Violent Crime Rate | 461 | 455 | 383 | 420 | 377 |
| Property Crime Rate | 2,459 | 2,636 | 2,552 | 2,378 | 2,425 |
| Officer Rate | 128.1 | 126.4 | 130.2 | 140.9 | 152.2 |
| ADP/Capacity | 0.90 | 0.94 | 0.94 | 0.91 | 0.83 |
| Capacity/Pop Rate | 326 | 287 | 266 | 241 | 234 |
| Proportion White | 48.7\% | 46.1\% | 49.6\% | 60.3\% | 57.0\% |
| Proportion African America | 4.5\% | 4.5\% | 3.4\% | 2.6\% | 1.9\% |
| Proportion Latino | 38.3\% | 38.8\% | 34.9\% | 25.5\% | 24.6\% |
| Share Foreign Born* | 23.7\% | 22.2\% | 22.2\% | 20.5\% | 26.3\% |
| Share 18-29 Year Olds | 17.5\% | 17.6\% | 17.3\% | 16.8\% | 15.1\% |
| Population Density | 129 | 278 | 667 | 678 | 1,413 |
| Poverty Rate | 18.7\% | 17.9\% | 16.9\% | 15.6\% | 11.6\% |
| Median Household Income | \$ 51,143 | \$ 53,857 | \$ 59,167 | \$ 59,547 | \$ 76,701 |
| Unemployment Rate | 9.7\% | 8.7\% | 7.5\% | 6.6\% | 5.3\% |
| Dropout Rate ${ }^{\text {\# }}$ | 7.3\% | 6.5\% | 5.8\% | 4.4\% | 3.8\% |
| College Graduates Rate\# | 20.5\% | 22.4\% | 32.2\% | 35.6\% | 47.4\% |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Department of Finance Population Data, Board of State and Community Corrections' Jail Profile Survey, California Department of Justice's Law Enforcement Personnel Survey, American Community Survey, California State Controller, California Employment Development Department, and the U.S. Census Bureau's Small Area Income and Poverty Estimates Program 2014-16.
NOTE: Arrest rates are the number of arrests made by law enforcement agencies per 100,000 residents, \# Data available only for the 41 largest counties. Each column represents county averages for the respective quintile. Population density is the ratio of residents in a county in a given year to the total square mileage of the county.

TABLE A9
Counties by African American/White Arrest Rate Ratio

| Counties by African American/White Arrest Rate Ratio Quintiles |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Bottom | $\mathbf{2}^{\text {nd }}$ | 3rd | 4th | Top |  |  |  |
| Del Norte | Amador | Butte | Alameda | Glenn |  |  |  |
| Imperial | Kern | Calaveras | El Dorado | Marin |  |  |  |
| Kings | Merced | Contra Costa | Humboldt | Napa |  |  |  |
| Lassen | Monterey | Fresno | Los Angeles | Nevada |  |  |  |
| Madera | Sacramento | Lake | Mendocino | Placer |  |  |  |
| Riverside | San Luis Obispo | Orange | San Benito | San Francisco |  |  |  |
| San Bernardino | Santa Barbara | San Diego | Shasta | San Mateo |  |  |  |
| San Joaquin | Solano | Siskiyou | Sonoma | Santa Clara |  |  |  |
| Tuolumne | Stanislaus | Tulare | Tehama | Santa Cruz |  |  |  |
| Yuba | Sutter | Ventura | Yolo |  |  |  |  |

SOURCES: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Department of Finance Population Data 2014-16.
NOTES: Calculations are quintiles based on each county's average arrest rate ratio (African American Arrest Rate divided by White Arrest Rate) over the three year period.

TABLE A10
OLS Regressions, Arrest Rate Ratio, African American/White.

|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Crime <br> Rates | Police/ Jail | Demographics/ Pop Density | Economic Factors | Immigration/ Education | All/Full Sample | All/34 Counties |
| Overall Arrest Rate | 0.010 | 0.011 | $0.014^{* *}$ | $0.013^{* *}$ | 0.012 | 0.008 | 0.007 |
| SE | 0.007 | 0.008 | 0.007 | 0.006 | 0.008 | 0.007 | 0.008 |
| Proportion African <br> America |  |  | -20.622 |  |  | -10.408 | -12.430 |
| SE |  |  | 14.223 |  |  | 14.632 | 15.302 |
| Proportion Latino |  |  | -0.340 |  |  | 2.275 | 2.821 |
| SE |  |  | 5.008 |  |  | 4.289 | 4.281 |
| Proportion Other |  |  | 5.008 |  |  | 0.423 | 24.473 |
| SE |  |  | 43.960 |  |  | 35.063 | 45.174 |
| Share 18-29 Year |  |  | -7.505 |  |  | -3.011 | -3.972 |
| SE |  |  | 4.677 |  |  | 4.748 | 5.337 |
| Proportion Male |  |  | -7.668 |  |  | -4.721 | 6.669 |
| SE |  |  | 17.021 |  |  | 20.470 | 25.438 |
| Population Density |  |  | 0.000 |  |  | -0.000 | -0.000 |
| SE |  |  | 0.001 |  |  | 0.001 | 0.001 |
| Officer Rate |  | 0.004 |  |  |  | 0.003 | 0.005* |
| SE |  | 0.004 |  |  |  | 0.003 | 0.003 |
| ADP/Rated Capacity |  | -0.223 |  |  |  | 0.345 | 0.319 |
| SE |  | 0.296 |  |  |  | 0.266 | 0.292 |
| Rated Capacity/Pop |  | 0.001 |  |  |  | $0.003^{* *}$ | $0.003^{* *}$ |
| SE |  | 0.002 |  |  |  | 0.001 | 0.001 |
| Violent Crime Rate | -0.079* |  |  |  |  | -0.046 | -0.020 |
| SE | 0.043 |  |  |  |  | 0.057 | 0.063 |
| Property Crime Rate | $0.028^{* * *}$ |  |  |  |  | 0.016* | 0.012 |
| SE | 0.010 |  |  |  |  | 0.009 | 0.009 |
| Median Household Income |  |  |  | 0.027*** |  | 0.028*** | 0.028** |
| SE |  |  |  | 0.009 |  | 0.009 | 0.011 |
| Poverty Rate |  |  |  | $-5.371^{* *}$ |  | -4.800* | -4.218* |
| SE |  |  |  | 2.444 |  | 2.486 | 2.801 |
| Unemployment Rate |  |  |  | 3.536 |  | 0.700 | 1.021 |
| SE |  |  |  | 3.401 |  | 3.482 | 3.323 |
| Share Foreign Born |  |  |  |  | 0.088 |  | -0.638 |
| SE |  |  |  |  | 2.250 |  | 2.803 |
| Dropout Rate |  |  |  |  | 0.457 |  | 0.288 |
| SE |  |  |  |  | 1.267 |  | 1.167 |
| College Graduates Rate |  |  |  |  | 6.046*** |  | 0.311 |
| SE |  |  |  |  | 1.850 |  | 1.990 |
| Constant | $2.882^{* * *}$ | $2.756^{* * *}$ | 10.516 | 1.674** | 0.655 | 3.971 | -2.676 |
| SE | 0.501 | 1.012 | 8.841 | 0.807 | 0.926 | 10.598 | 13.366 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |


|  | (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Crime Rates | Police/ Jail | Demographics/ Pop Density | Economic Factors | Immigration/ Education | All/Full Sample | All/34 Counties |
| Observations | 490 | 490 | 490 | 490 | 340 | 490 | 340 |
| R-squared | 0.961 | 0.960 | 0.963 | 0.965 | 0.965 | 0.968 | 0.972 |

SOURCE: Author calculation based on California Department of Justice's Monthly Arrest and Citation Register, California Department of Finance Population Data, Board of State and Community Corrections' Jail Profile Survey, California Department of Justice's Law Enforcement Personnel Survey, American Community Survey, California State Controller, California Employment Development Department, and the U.S. Census Bureau's Small Area Income and Poverty Estimates Program, 2007-2016.
NOTE: Robust standard errors in rows beneath coefficients *** $p<0.01, * * p<0.05, * p<0.1$. All models include county and year fixed effects. Annual county level data for educational attainment and the share of foreign born is available only for the 34 largest counties. Population density is the ratio of residents in a county in a given year to the total square mileage of the county

## Appendix B. Information on Contextual Variables

Crime data were obtained from the California Department of Justice (CA DOJ). California crime and clearance files with monthly data obtained from CA DOJ under an MOU that does not allow for public release. However, yearly crime data and crime reports can be obtained from CA DOJ's Open Justice Data Portal (https://openjustice.doj.ca.gov/data).

Jail capacity, average daily population, and incarceration data were gleaned from the Board of State and Community Corrections’ (BSCC) Jail Profile Survey (JPS) data tool
(https://app.bscc.ca.gov/joq//jps/QuerySelection.asp). Though the JPS contains data as early as 1995, rated capacity data are not available prior to 2007. To maximize the amount of usable data, we obtained rated capacity data through request of what was then the Corrections Standard Authority (CSA), giving us capacity data as early as 1997 and merged this with the overall JPS dataset. We then aggregated those data from the individual jail facility level to the county and state levels by averaging or summing the figures where appropriate. Incarceration rates were obtained by dividing the average daily population by the county or state population using demographic data from California Department of Finance, discussed below.

Law enforcement staffing data were obtained through California Department of Justice's (DOJ) Open Justice Data Portal (https://openjustice.doj.ca.gov/data). The DOJ Criminal Justice Statistics Center (CJSC) collects information on the number of funded and not-funded, full-time sworn and non-sworn, male and female law enforcement personnel (LEP) employed by law enforcement agencies (LEAs). The CJSC collects the Law Enforcement Personnel data through a one-day survey taken on October 31st of each reporting year.

The California Department of Finance (CA DOF), Demographics and Research Unit, is tasked with publishing the state's official annual population estimates at the state, county and city levels. These estimates are benchmarked on the decennial census' population statistics, and then utilize a variety of state administrative sources to estimate changes during the intercensal years. For the years 1980-2010, we make use of the E-7 Annual Intercensal Population Estimates by Race/Ethnicity with Age and Gender Detail estimate tables, available for download on the DOF website (http://www.dof.ca.gov/Forecasting/Demographics/Estimates/). For the years 2011-2016, we utilize DOF's demographic projections from the P-3 State and County Projections Dataset (http://www.dof.ca.gov/Forecasting /Demographics/Projections/). In their standard formats, these datasets contain the year of observation, the long form of
the county of observation's geographically identifying FIPS code, and the number of people within a county by gender, race/ethnicity, and age. The available race/ethnicity categories available for all years of the data are White, African American, American Indian, Asian/Pacific Islander, and Hispanic.

The population density variable is a proxy for ruralness, created by dividing the county's total population by the county's total square mileage reported by the California State Controller in their County Fiscal Year dataset (https://bythenumbers.sco.ca.gov/Raw-Data/Counties-Raw-Data-for-Fiscal-Years-2003-2016/esdm-5xr2).

Employment and wage data were gathered from the California Employment Development Department's data portal (https://www.labormarketinfo.edd.ca.gov/data/labor-market-data-library.html\#LIB). Data were aggregated from the industry and monthly level to the county and yearly level to allow these data to be merged with the arrest data. Poverty data were gathered from the Small Area Income and Poverty Estimates Program of the U.S. Census Bureau (https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/saipe/data/datasets.html).

Data on the share of foreign born residents, the school dropout rate, and the college graduation rate were gathered from the American Community Survey (ACS) of the U.S. Census Bureau using the IPUMS tool run by the University of Minnesota (https://usa.ipums.org/usa/). The ACS, though accurate is unable to reliably estimate certain statistics for California's smallest counties and thus these variables only contain data for the state's 41 largest counties.

# The Public Policy Institute of California is dedicated to informing and improving public policy in California through independent, objective, nonpartisan research. 

Public Policy Institute of California 500 Washington Street, Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94111
T: 415.291.4400
F: 415.291.4401
PPIC.ORG

PPIC Sacramento Center
Senator Office Building
1121 L Street, Suite 801
Sacramento, CA 95814
T: 916.440.1120
F: 916.440.1121

